



## Arizona State Board of Dental Examiners

“Caring for the Public’s Dental Health  
and Professional Standards”



1740 West Adams Street, Suite 2470  
Phoenix, Arizona 85007  
P: 602.242.1492  
E: [info@dentalboard.az.gov](mailto:info@dentalboard.az.gov)  
W: [www.dentalboard.az.gov](http://www.dentalboard.az.gov)

### OPEN SESSION MINUTES

#### May 16, 2025 Board Meeting

On the aforementioned date, members of the Arizona State Board of Dental Examiners’ (“Board”) held a board meeting at the Board’s office, in Boardroom A, 1740 West Adams Street, Phoenix, Arizona 85007. The meeting was also held virtually and telephonically. The Board met in executive session during its consideration of agenda items V.B.1 through V.B.4, V.D.8 and V.F.1 as stated herein.

#### BOARD MEMBERS

	<i>Anthony Herro, DDS</i>	President and Licensed Dentist Member
X	Lisa B. Bienstock, DMD	Vice-President and Licensed Dentist Member
	<i>Mary T. Rossi</i>	Business Entity Member
	<i>Edward H. Christensen, DDS</i>	Licensed Dentist Member
X	Aditya Dynar	Public Member
X	Tamer El-Gendy, DMD	Licensed Dentist Member
	<i>Nick Goodman</i>	Public Member
	<i>Jaselyn K. Karmo, RDH</i>	Licensed Hygienist Member
	<i>Russell Jeffrey Morrow, DDS</i>	Licensed Dentist Member
	<i>Vicki B. Penna, RDH</i>	Licensed Hygienist Member
	<i>Leslie D. Seaman, DDS</i>	Licensed Dentist Member
	Joined/deperted as denoted in the body of the minutes	
X	Absent	
	<i>Board members in italics participated in-person</i>	

#### STAFF AND ASSISTANT ATTORNEY(S) GENERAL PRESENT

<i>Ryan P. Edmonson</i>	Executive Director
<i>Kristina C. Gomez</i>	Deputy Director
<i>Scott Donald, Esq.</i>	Assistant Attorney General
<i>Carrie Smith, Esq.</i>	Independent Legal Advisor
<i>John W. Dovgan, DDS</i>	Chief Investigator
<i>Sherrie Biggs</i>	Assistant Deputy Director
<i>Jessica Solis</i>	Compliance Officer
<i>Tanya Vasquez</i>	Compliance Officer
<i>Yazmin Bustamante</i>	Executive Assistant

*Staff members in italics participated in-person*

## GUESTS PARTICIPATING AND/OR PRESENT

Chris Smith, Esq.	Licensee for Respondent
Robert Wood	Licensee
Isaiah Herrera, Esq.	Attorney for Respondents
Robert Janisse	Respondent
Leah Schachar, Esq.	Attorney for Respondents
Daniel Kang	Respondent
McCauslin Rainwater	Respondent
R.M.	Complainant
A.P.	Complainant
Jeffery J. Tonner, Esq.	Attorney for Respondents
Casey Cutler	Respondent
Heather Curcio	Respondent
Jeffrey Schmelter	Respondent
Ashley Camarena	Witness
Calvin Brown	Respondent
John Shoaf, Esq.	Attorney for Respondent
Richard Coburn	Respondent
Michele Thompson, Esq.	Attorney for Respondents
Phillip Cook	Respondent
David Yang	Respondent

### I. CALL TO ORDER AND ROLL CALL

Dr. Herro called the Board's meeting to order at 8:10 a.m. Roll call of the Board members was taken and a quorum was established.

### II. DECLARATION OF CONFLICTS OF INTEREST – A.R.S. § 38-503

Dr. Herro declared a conflict of interest with agenda item no. V.G.1.

Ms. Rossi declared a conflict of interest with agenda item no. IV.D.6.

Dr. Morrow declared conflicts of interest with agenda item nos. IV.C.4. And V.D.8.

Dr. Christensen declared a conflict of interest with agenda item no. V.D.5.

Dr. Seaman declared a conflict of interest with agenda item no. V.E.1.

### III. REVIEW, DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE ACTION ON BOARD MEETING MINUTES

A. Discussion and approval of the Open Session Minutes from the April 11, 2025 board meeting.

B. Discussion and approval of the Executive Session Minutes from the April 11, 2025 board meeting.

**Audio Start Time:** 0:2:35

**Motion:** Dr. Morrow moved to approve the open session and executive session minutes from the April 11, 2025 board meeting.

**Second:** Dr. Christensen

**Vote:** 7-aye, 0-nay, 1-abstain, 0-recuse, 3-absent. Motion passed.

*Dr. Herro abstained.*

**IV. CONSENT AGENDA****A. Application(s) for Licensing of Dentist(s) or Hygienist(s) – A.R.S. §§ 32-1231 et seq. and 32-1281 et. seq. respectively**

1. Jeffrey Haskins, DDS (*by Credentials*)

**B. Termination of Board Orders(s)/Consent Agreements(s)**

1. 201900282-AO; Pourshirazi, Ehsan
2. 202400026; Zenner, Robert

**C. Review of Investigation(s) – Case(s) Recommended for Dismissal**

1. 202400271; Core, Gary
2. 202400412; Williams, Kenneth
3. 202400415; Yasso, Monique
4. 202400466; Stanger, Ryan
5. 202400477; Smith, Christopher
6. 202400506; Williams, Noel
7. 202500002; Belbas, John
8. 202500019; Burns, Jerry

**D. Review of Investigation(s) – Case(s) Recommended for a Letter of Concern**

1. 202400360; Bull, Joseph
- ~~2. 202400398; Melashenko, Jason~~
3. 202400413; Ahir, Khushbu
4. 202400449; Persky, Elizabeth
5. 202400450; Uvaydov, Sarah
6. 202500005; Coon, Deneen

**Audio Start Time:** 0:04:50

The Board pulled case IV.D.2 from the consent agenda for further discussion.

**Motion:** Dr. Herro moved to accept the consent agenda as written with the exception of case IV.D.2, which was previously pulled for discussion.

**Second:** Ms. Penna

**Vote:** 6-aye, 0-nay, 0-abstain, 2-recuse, 3-absent. Motion passed.

**D. Review of Investigation(s) – Case(s) Recommended for a Letter of Concern**

2. 202400398; Melashenko, Jason

**Audio Start Time:** 0:07:20

**Motion:** Dr. Morrow moved to offer a non-disciplinary consent agreement, requiring the completion of 4 hours of CE in risk management, based on the allegations in the consultant's report and the discussion held during the meeting. The CE hours shall be in addition to the hours required for license renewal and shall be completed within six months.

**Second:** Dr. Herro

**Vote:** 8-aye, 0-nay, 0-abstain, 0-recuse, 3-absent. Motion passed.

**V. ITEMS FOR BOARD REVIEW, DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE ACTION**

**A. Review of 1301 Permit Late Renewal Request**

**1. Robert S. Wood, DDS**

**Audio Start Time:** 0:11:10

**Motion:** Dr. Morrow moved to adopt violation of A.R.S. § 32-1263(A)(4).

**Second:** Dr. Herro

**Vote:** 8-aye, 0-nay, 0-abstain, 0-recuse, 3-absent. Motion passed.

**Motion:** Dr. Herro moved to issue a non-disciplinary order, requiring the completion of 4 hours of CE in risk management and grant the permit renewal.

**Second:** Ms. Rossi

**Vote:** 3-aye, 5-nay, 0-abstain, 0-recuse, 3-absent. Motion failed.

*Mr. Goodman, Dr. Morrow, Ms. Penna, Ms. Rossi and Dr. Seaman voted against the motion.*

**Motion:** Dr. Morrow moved to offer a disciplinary consent agreement with a \$2,000 fine due to the late permit renewal. After signing the agreement and paying the fine, the permit renewal is to be granted. The respondent has 30 days after signing the agreement to pay the fine. In addition, the licensee is required to complete 3 hours of CE in ethics. The CE hours shall be in addition to the hours required for license renewal and shall be completed within three months.

**Second:** Ms. Penna

**Vote:** 5-aye, 3-nay, 0-abstain, 0-recuse, 3-absent. Motion passed.

*Dr. Herro, Dr. Christensen and Ms. Karmo voted against the motion.*

**B. Review of Investigation(s) – Unauthorized Practice – A.R.S. § 32-3227**

1. 202400408; Bassue, Alezrah,
2. 202400409; Osterman, Daecha,
3. 202400410; Osterman, Mason and
4. 202500004; Montoya, Ofelia

**Audio Start Time:** 0:45:40

**Motion:** Dr. Herro moved for the Board to enter into executive session to obtain legal advice for agenda item nos. V.B.1 through V.B.4 pursuant to A.R.S. § 38-431.03(A)(3).

**Second:** Dr. Morrow

**Vote:** 8-aye, 0-nay, 0-abstain, 0-recuse, 3-absent. Motion passed.

*The Board entered into executive session at 8:56 a.m.*

*The Board returned to open session at 9:22 a.m.*

*No legal action was taken by the Board during executive session.*

F. Petition for Rehearing/Review – A.A.C. R4-11-1701

1. 202300482; Janisse, Robert  
OAH Case No.: 24F-202300482-DEN

**Audio Start Time:** 1:12:30

**Motion:** Ms. Penna moved for the Board to enter into executive session to obtain legal advice pursuant to A.R.S. § 38-431.03(A)(3).

**Second:** Dr. Morrow

**Vote:** 8-aye, 0-nay, 0-abstain, 0-recuse, 3-absent. Motion passed.

*The Board entered into executive session at 9:42 a.m.*

*The Board returned to open session at 10:06 a.m.*

*No legal action was taken by the Board during executive session.*

**Motion:** Dr. Herro moved to deny the request for review and rehearing.

**Second:** Dr. Morrow

**Vote:** 8-aye, 0-nay, 0-abstain, 0-recuse, 3-absent. Motion passed.

B. Review of Investigation(s) – Unauthorized Practice – A.R.S. § 32-3227

1. 202400408; Bassue, Alezrah

**Audio Start Time:** 2:05:05

**Motion:** Dr. Herro moved to issue a cease and desist and refer to the Attorney General's Office to file an injunction, based on violation of A.R.S. § 32-3227.

**Second:** Dr. Christensen

**Vote:** 8-aye, 0-nay, 0-abstain, 0-recuse, 3-absent. Motion passed.

2. 202400409; Osterman, Daecha  
and
3. 202400410; Osterman, Mason

**Audio Start Time:** 2:07:55

**Motion:** Dr. Herro moved to issue a cease and desist and refer to the Attorney General's Office to file an injunction, based on the violation of A.R.S. § 32-3227.

**Second:** Dr. Christensen

**Vote:** 8-aye, 0-nay, 0-abstain, 0-recuse, 3-absent. Motion passed.

4. 202500004; Montoya, Ofelia

**Audio Start Time:** 2:11:45

**Motion:** Dr. Herro moved to issue a cease and desist and refer to the Attorney General's Office to file an injunction, based on the violation of A.R.S. § 32-3227.

**Second:** Dr. Christensen

**Vote:** 8-aye, 0-nay, 0-abstain, 0-recuse, 3-absent. Motion passed.

C. Review of Investigation(s) – Case(s) Recommended for Issuance of a Non-Disciplinary Order for Continuing Education – A.R.S. § 32-1263.02(F)(3)

1. 202400349; Holbrook, Ryan

**Audio Start Time:** 2:13:45

**Motion:** Ms. Karmo moved to issue a non-disciplinary order, requiring the completion of 4 hours of CE in risk management, based on the discussion held during the meeting regarding the identified recordkeeping issues and the consultant report.

**Second:** Dr. Christensen

**Vote:** 8-aye, 0-nay, 0-abstain, 0-recuse, 3-absent. Motion passed.

2. 202400462; Chandrakeerthi, Chirdeep

**Audio Start Time:** 2:18:10

**Motion:** Dr. Herro moved to adopt violation of A.R.S. § 32-1201.01(24).

**Second:** Dr. Christensen

**Vote:** 8-aye, 0-nay, 0-abstain, 0-recuse, 3-absent. Motion passed.

**Motion:** Dr. Herro moved to issue a non-disciplinary order, requiring the completion of 4 hours of CE in risk management, based on the previously established violation, the discussion held during the meeting and the consultant report. The CE hours shall be in addition to the hours required for license renewal and shall be completed within three months.

**Second:** Dr. Morrow

**Vote:** 8-aye, 0-nay, 0-abstain, 0-recuse, 3-absent. Motion passed.

3. 202400467; Bland, Nicholas

**Audio Start Time:** 2:22:50

**Motion:** Dr. Herro moved to adopt violations of A.R.S. § 32-1263(D)(12) and (15).

**Second:** Dr. Morrow

**Vote:** 8-aye, 0-nay, 0-abstain, 0-recuse, 3-absent. Motion passed.

**Motion:** Dr. Herro moved to further adopt violation of A.R.S. § 32-1201.01(14).

**Second:** Dr. Christensen

**Vote:** 8-aye, 0-nay, 0-abstain, 0-recuse, 3-absent. Motion passed.

**Motion:** Dr. Herro moved to offer an interim consent agreement to restrict the 1303 Permit for 90 days, while a chart audit is performed. The chart audit is to include up to 30 charts over the course of 24 months, limited to oral sedation. The licensee has 10 business days to sign the agreement. The agreement is based on the previously adopted violations, the consultant's report and the discussion held during the meeting.

**Second:** Dr. Christensen

**Vote:** 8-aye, 0-nay, 0-abstain, 0-recuse, 3-absent. Motion passed.

*Dr. Christensen temporarily departed the meeting at 10:50 a.m.*

**D. Review of Investigation(s) – Case(s) Recommended for an Offer of a Disciplinary Consent Agreement**

1. 202400350; Kang, Daniel

**Audio Start Time:** 2:34:15

**Motion:** Ms. Penna moved to dismiss the case.

**Second:** Dr. Herro

**Vote:** 7-aye, 0-nay, 0-abstain, 0-recuse, 4-absent. Motion passed.

2. 202400384; Rainwater, McCauslin

**Audio Start Time:** 2:45:00

**Motion:** Ms. Penna moved to dismiss the case.

**Second:** Dr. Herro

**Vote:** 5-aye, 2-nay, 0-abstain, 0-recuse, 4-absent. Motion passed.

*Dr. Morrow and Ms. Rossi voted against the motion.*

3. 202400387; Abedi, Payam

**Audio Start Time:** 3:00:00

**Motion:** Dr. Herro moved to adopt violations of A.R.S. § 32-1201.01(14) and (24).

**Second:** Ms. Penna

**Vote:** 7-aye, 0-nay, 0-abstain, 0-recuse, 4-absent. Motion passed.

**Motion:** Dr. Herro moved to offer a disciplinary consent agreement, requiring completion of the CRDTS C.A.R.E. program, including 4 hours of CE in diagnosis and treatment planning, 4 hours in recordkeeping and 4 hours in restorative care. In addition, to order restitution for \$910 to the patient. The agreement is to be signed within 30 days and restitution is also to be paid within 30 days. The respondent has 12 months to complete the CE. The agreement is based on the previously adopted violations, the consultant's report and the discussion held during the meeting.

**Second:** Dr. Morrow

**Vote:** 7-aye, 0-nay, 0-abstain, 0-recuse, 4-absent. Motion passed.

4. 202400419; Choules, William

**Audio Start Time:** 3:06:00

**Motion:** Dr. Herro moved to adopt violations of A.R.S. § 32-1201.01(14), (23) and (24).

**Second:** Dr. Morrow

**Vote:** 7-aye, 0-nay, 0-abstain, 0-recuse, 4-absent. Motion passed.

*Dr. Christensen rejoined the meeting at 11:30 a.m.*

**Motion:** Dr. Herro moved to issue a non-disciplinary order, requiring the completion of 4 hours of CE in risk management. In addition, to impose a \$500 penalty for failure to comply with a subpoena, based on the previously established violations, the discussion held during the meeting and the consultant report. The CE hours shall be in addition to the hours required for license renewal and shall be completed within 90 days.

**Second:** Dr. Morrow

**Vote:** 5-aye, 2-nay, 1-abstain, 0-recuse, 3-absent. Motion passed.

*Ms. Penna and Dr. Seaman voted against the motion.*

*Dr. Christensen abstained.*

5. 202400425; Cutler, Casey

**Audio Start Time:** 3:23:00

**Motion:** Mr. Goodman moved to dismiss the case.

**Second:** Dr. Herro

**Vote:** 7-aye, 0-nay, 0-abstain, 1-recuse, 3-absent. Motion passed.

*Dr. Christensen was recused and did not participate in the matter.*

6. 202400437; Curcio, Heather

**Audio Start Time:** 3:32:00

**Motion:** Ms. Penna moved to issue a letter of concern for failure to inform a patient of a complication.

**Second:** Dr. Morrow

**Vote:** 7-aye, 1-nay, 0-abstain, 0-recuse, 3-absent. Motion passed.

*Mr. Goodman voted against the motion.*

The Board further directed staff to open an investigation against Dental Depot as identified in the consultant report.



7. 202400438; Schmelter, Jeffrey

**Audio Start Time:** 3:43:30

**Motion:** Dr. Herro moved to adopt violation of A.R.S. § 32-1201.01(14).

**Second:** Dr. Morrow

**Vote:** 8-aye, 0-nay, 0-abstain, 0-recuse, 3-absent. Motion passed.

**Motion:** Dr. Herro moved to issue a letter of concern for excessive time under anesthesia and lack of local anesthetic documentation.

**Second:** Dr. Christensen

**Vote:** 8-aye, 0-nay, 0-abstain, 0-recuse, 3-absent. Motion passed.

8. 202400475; Brown, Calvin

**Audio Start Time:** 3:58:00

**Motion:** Dr. Herro moved to adopt violations of A.R.S. § 32-1201.01(14) and (24).

**Second:** Ms. Karmo

**Vote:** 7-aye, 0-nay, 0-abstain, 1-recuse, 3-absent. Motion passed.

*Dr. Morrow was recused and did not participate in the matter.*

**Motion:** Dr. Herro moved for the Board to enter into executive session to obtain legal advice pursuant to A.R.S. § 38-431.03(A)(3).

**Second:** Ms. Penna

**Vote:** 7-aye, 0-nay, 0-abstain, 1-recuse, 3-absent. Motion passed.

*Dr. Morrow was recused and did not participate in the matter.*

*The Board entered into executive session at 12:13 p.m.*

*The Board returned to open session at 12:26 p.m.*

*No legal action was taken by the Board during executive session.*

**Motion:** Dr. Herro moved to offer a disciplinary consent agreement with a decree of censure based on the previously adopted violations, the discussion held today and the consultant's report.

**Second:** Dr. Christensen

*Dr. Herro rescinded the motion.*

**Motion:** Dr. Herro moved to offer a disciplinary consent agreement with a decree of censure based on the previously adopted violations, the discussion held today, the consultant's report and the history of prior board actions.

**Second:** Dr. Christensen

**Vote:** 7-aye, 0-nay, 0-abstain, 1-recuse, 3-absent. Motion passed.

*Dr. Morrow was recused and did not participate in the matter.*

9. 202500003; Coburn, Richard

**Audio Start Time:** 4:25:30

**Motion:** Dr. Herro moved to issue a letter of concern for risk management.

**Second:** Dr. Morrow

**Vote:** 8-aye, 0-nay, 0-abstain, 0-recuse, 3-absent. Motion passed.

G. Response/Non-response to Offered/Issued Consent Agreement(s)/Board Order(s)

1. 202400197; Cooke, Phillip

**Audio Start Time:** 4:36:45

**Motion:** Dr. Morrow moved to amend the order to remove the practice restriction of sedation and re-offer the disciplinary consent agreement. The respondent has 30 days to sign the agreement.

**Second:** Ms. Rossi

**Vote:** 6-aye, 1-nay, 0-abstain, 1-recuse, 3-absent. Motion passed.

*Mr. Goodman voted against the motion.*

*Dr. Herro was recused and did not participate in the matter.*

*Dr. Christensen departed the meeting at 12:44 p.m.*

E. Formal Interview(s)

1. 202400202; Yang, David

**Audio Start Time:** 4:44:30

**Motion:** Dr. Morrow moved to issue a board order as written in the consent agreement that was previously offered, based on the findings of facts, the consultant's report and the discussion held during the formal interview. Also, board staff is to confirm the restitution amount.

**Second:** Dr. Herro

**Vote:** 6-aye, 0-nay, 0-abstain, 1-recuse, 4-absent. Motion passed.

*Dr. Seaman was recused and did not participate in the matter.*

**VI. CALL TO THE PUBLIC**

No one addressed the Board.

**VII. RECOGNITION OF SERVICE**

John W. Dovgan, DDS, Chief Investigator..... 2020 – 2025

**VIII. ASSISTANT ATTORNEY GENERAL (“AAG”) REPORT**

There was no discussion.

## **IX. EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR’S REPORT**

**Audio Start Time:** 5:28:50

- A. Budget Update  
Mr. Edmonson invited the Board to pose any questions they may have concerning the budget that is provided at each meeting.
- B. Agency Operations  
Mr. Edmonson informed the Board that the vacancies in compliance have been filled.
- C. Complaint Log  
The Board did not have any questions regarding the complaint log.

## **X. LEGISLATIVE UPDATE**

- 1. Dental Specific Bills
  - a. SB1037 Health boards; fund balances; fees
  - b. SB1081 S/E timelines; complaints; health boards
  - c. SB1124 Dental board; oral preventive assistants
  - d. SB1235 Health profession regulatory boards; membership
  - e. SB1335 AHCCCS; teledentistry; report
  - f. SB1347 AHCCCS; comprehensive dental care
  - g. SB1448 S/E Dentists; dental hygienists; compact
  - h. SB1527 Occupational boards; renewal extension
  - i. HB2026 Dental board; formal hearings
  - j. HB2137 Dental board; licensure; renewal
  - k. HB2173 Mental health inquiry; prohibition
  - l. HB2190 Dentists; dental hygienists; compact
  - m. HB2250 AHCCCS; preventative dental care
  - n. HB2312 Dental board; continuation
  - o. HB2828 Dental board; fingerprint card; maintenance
- 2. Other Impactful Bills
  - a. SB1587 Health boards; third-party contracting
  - b. HB2031 Boards and commissions; repeal
  - c. HB2061 Administrative proceedings; jury trials
  - d. HB2276 Legislative ratification; rulemaking; regulatory costs
  - e. HB2351 Health professionals; website; time limitation
  - f. HB2632 Regulatory costs; rulemaking; legislative ratification
  - g. HB2708 Trial by jury; regulatory proceedings
  - h. HB2874 Excessive health insurance claims; notification
  - i. HB2875 Health professionals; unprofessional conduct
  - j. HB2927 Public meetings; records; requirements; penalties

**Audio Start Time:** 5:32:00

Mr. Edmonson provided the Board an update of recent bills signed by the Governor. With the passing of SB1124, a special board meeting will be held on June 30th to

discuss the implementation of the new Oral Preventative Assistant profession. Mr. Edmonson further informed the Board that HB2026 passed, allowing the Board to move egregious matters directly to a formal hearing.

**XI. ASSISTANCE AND ADVICE**

No one addressed the Board.

**XII. SUMMARY OF CURRENT EVENTS**

Mr. Edmonson informed the Board that no comments were submitted during the A&S oral proceeding and the rulemaking package will be submitted to GRRC.

**XIII. DISCUSSION REGARDING FUTURE MEETINGS AND POSSIBLE ACTION ITEMS FOR FUTURE MEETING AGENDAS**

The Board requested that discussion of continuing education for out-of-state individuals be placed on the next board agenda.

**XIV. NEXT BOARD MEETING DATE**

A. June 27, 2025

**XV. ADJOURNMENT**

Dr. Herro adjourned the meeting at 1:52 p.m.